



Deviation of The Use of Discipline and Punishment in The novel *Animal Farm* by George Orwell

Nabila Citra¹, Dyani Prades Pratiwi²

^{1,2}English Department, Universitas Andalas, Padang, Indonesia

E-mail: dyanipradespratiwi@hum.unand.ac.id

ABSTRAK

Disiplin dan hukuman membuat manusia menaati aturan dan telah digunakan sejak zaman dahulu hingga sekarang. *Animal Farm* merupakan salah satu novel yang mengangkat isu tersebut. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menunjukkan disiplin dan hukuman yang terdapat dalam novel ini dan bagaimana metode tersebut menjadi alat untuk menghasilkan relasi kuasa. Metode penelitian ini adalah metode kualitatif, sedangkan analisisnya akan menggunakan teori Foucault tentang disiplin dan hukuman. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa sistem penerapan disiplin dan hukuman menghasilkan relasi kuasa antara penguasa dan hewan di peternakan. Banyak sekali penyalahgunaan dalam novel ini yang disebabkan oleh beberapa faktor seperti keserakahan dan keegoisan, dan juga kurangnya edukasi terhadap hewan yang mengakibatkan hewan tidak dapat berbuat apa-apa. Akibat sistem yang salah dan tidak diterapkan sebagaimana mestinya serta penyimpangan penggunaan disiplin dan hukuman, banyak pula kejadian yang tidak diharapkan. Dimulai dari hewan yang melakukan pemberontakan yang awalnya ditujukan untuk perdamaian dan kebebasan bersama, namun setelah pemberontakan tersebut terjadi hal sebaliknya yaitu penjajahan antar sesama hewan.

Keywords: *Animal Farm*, Disiplin dan Hukuman, George Orwell, Michelle Foucault

ABSTRACT

Discipline and punishment makes people obey the rules and have been used from the ancient times to the presents. *Animal Farm* is one of the novels that present these issues. This study aims to show the discipline and punishment contained in this novel and how these methods become the tools of producing power relation. The method of this study is qualitative method, while the analysis will be analysed with using Foucault's theory about discipline and punishment. The result of the study shows that The system of implementing the discipline and punishment produce the power relation between the ruler and the animals in the farm. There is a lot of abuse in this novel due to several factors such as greed and selfishness, and also there is a lack of education for the animals which results in the animals being unable to do anything. Due to the wrong system that is not implemented accordingly and the deviation of the use of discipline and punishment, many unexpected events also occur. Starting with the animals committing a rebellion that was originally intended for peace and freedom together, but after the rebellion, the opposite occurred, which is the colonization between fellow animals.

Keywords: *Animal Farm*, Discipline and Punishment, George Orwell, Michelle Foucault

INTRODUCTION

From ancient times to the present, many rulers have used the application of the science of discipline and punishment. Because it is proven that at this time the science of discipline and

punishment makes people obey the rules that were made by the ruler. In which if the rules are violated, the result is punishment. In the real world, the law of discipline power is often applied in schools, hospitals, and prisons (Saphiro, 2002).

The science of discipline and power is not far from the word “power”. A person in achieving power must be able to conquer his power. For example, in George Orwell's literary work *Animal Farm*, there is the science of discipline and punishment, where Napoleon and the pigs apply a series of legal rules and punishments to regulate the animals in the farm, starting from the use of a series of main rules called the seven commanders, so that they can still be carried out according to the wishes of the Pigs and Napoleon. Then Napoleon used legal rulers (discipline) for the other animals. One form of punishment is that the animals will be hurt by Napoleon's dog.

The writer of this novel, George Orwell, is a British novelist, essayist, and critic. Instead of accepting a scholarship to a university, Orwell went to Burma to serve in the Indian Imperial Police (1922–1927), to get an experience that changed him into a literary and political rebel. On returning to Europe, he lived in self-imposed poverty, gaining material for *Down and Out in Paris and London* (1933) and became a socialist. He went to Spain to report on the Spanish Civil War and stayed to join the Republican militia. His war experiences, which gave him a lifelong dread of communism, which he would later provide British intelligence services with lists of his fellow British communists, are recounted in *Homage to Catalonia* (1938). Orwell's novels typically portray a sensitive, conscientious, emotionally isolated individual at odds with an oppressive or dishonest social environment. His most famous works are the anti-Soviet satirical fable *Animal Farm* (1945) and *1984* (1949), a dystopic vision of totalitarianism whose influence was widely felt in the postwar decades. According to Britannica, his literary essays are also admired (Britannica.com).

Animal Farm is a phenomenal work by George Orwell that has been interpreted in many academic papers and articles. In the article review by Patrick T. Reardon (2023), he tells the readers about power corrupts in *Animal Farm*. Furthermore, Reardon also mentions about echoes of any revolution. Another article review about *Animal Farm* is from Yussef Cole entitled *Orwell's Animal Farm Sticks a Bit Too Close to the Source Material* (2020). Here, Cole tells the readers about the interview result with Imre Jele. The interview is about Imre Jele's feelings related to this book. In a way that it feels so real. Somehow, Orwell explains the conditions in the farm that are correlated to reality.

The academic article of a journal with the title *An Analysis Of Power Struggle In George Orwell's Novel 'Animal Farm'* by Ahmad Faizal (2024) tells the readers about the power struggle

in *Animal Farm*. That occurs in farms, the power struggles between groups of animals in the farm that leads to the animals struggle to power propaganda. Faizal gave a statement: “the propaganda process carried out by animal farms is the animal revolution” (Faizal, 2024). This article gave some insights for this research to know more about power relation in this novel. In the book *Animal Farm*, it is explained that the conflict begins with a conflict between humans and animals until they attack each other using propaganda.

Another academic article which is the article by Dr. Abdelnaeim Ibrahim Awad Elaref (2022) gives a statement: “The totalitarian regime uses the media to manipulate its citizens' minds”. This can be accomplished by seizing complete control of the media and maintaining the appearance of normalcy. This study also used Foucault theory's discourse manipulation. Moreover, the author of this article also used the same object with Dr. Elaref which is *Animal Farm*. In the book *Animal Farm*, the media to manipulate is created by Squealer. It can be concluded that Squealer is an agent of the ruling party's propaganda institute. This article focused on how the power relation worked in the farm with the propaganda strategy. While, this study will focus on discipline and punishment contained in the novel.

Based on the theory approach the author analyzes the *Animal Farm* book and uses Foucault Theory about Discipline and Punishment. The definition of that theory is based on the Foucault book's work with the title *The Birth of The Prison*. Initially, discipline and punishment was a theory inspired by the 17th and 18th centuries. This theory refers to how Foucault analyzed how cruel traditional punishments were then changed into more humane punishments through the application of disciplinary sciences over time.

METHODOLOGY

As for the method, this study uses qualitative method to collect the data and complete the research. A qualitative method needs five phases for the analysis process. The first is organizing and searching the data. The next step is sorting the data. The function to sort the data is to make the researchers easier to sort the relevant data related to the problems. The next phase, the author identifies ideas in the data. Here, the researchers start to identify key ideas in relation to the research. Another step is interpreting data, the researchers develop the theory, themes, and write the article based on the primary and secondary data. The primary data is *Animal Farm* by George Orwell, while the secondary data is from some articles and journals from the internet then rewrite the data and elaborate more in the author's own language. Because this article is

using Foucault theory, the author needs to take information from Foucault's book which is related to the data.

Discussing the Foucault theory, it is closely related to power, where the contents of the science itself are like this Foucault conceptualized power as it is exercised, as multiple and decentralized, and as productive of social structures and knowledge (Turek,1990). In the science of power, according to Foucault, it is also embedded in the science of discipline and punishment, the science of discipline and punishment is Foucault's aim to trace the way in which incarceration was transformed between the seventeenth and twentieth centuries. What started as a spectacle, in which ritual punishments were focused on the prisoner's body, eventually became a matter of the private discipline of a delinquent soul (Foucault, 2000).

“‘Discipline’ may be identified neither with an institution nor with an apparatus; it is a type of power, a modality for its exercise, comprising a whole set of instruments, techniques, procedures, levels of application, targets; it is a ‘physics’ or an ‘anatomy’ of power, a technology.” (Foucault, 2012).

In the book *The Birth of The Prison* (1975) by Foucault in the chapter *Docile Bodies* explained here the form of the relationship between discipline and punishment according to Foucault. The relationship between discipline and punishment has its own purpose. Punishment according to Foucault aims to suppress, deter, prevent, and eliminate crime. Punishment must also go through a series of training, control, which has positive and useful consequences. Discipline theory itself is a form of correction and education so that the technique of effective discipline makes the body as the main object to be regulated. Everyone definitely wants to avoid pain in the body. So, a learning system was created that is based on punishment-rewards relying on body obedience.

In the analysis stage, the researchers aims to analyze the *Animal Farm* book by George Orwell using Foucault theory, especially discipline and punishment theory. Then, the next step is the author collecting data from the primary, the primary data means the object that the author wants to analyze. Here the author chose one of the works of literature by George Orwell, *Animal Farm*. Then the second data is the journals and articles from the internet which relate to the theory and the object the author wants to analyze. The next step the author collects and combines the data, which are the primary data and secondary data. The final step is analyzing the object with data. Here, the author tries to match the secondary data with the primary data and starts to organize the data.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

Discipline and punishment existed long before Foucault's theory of discipline and punishment. In ancient times, the practice of discipline and punishment could be considered harsh or cruel. For the practice of punishment, the ancients used unusual and brutal methods, for example public executions. In monarchical times public executions were always watched by many people in the public. This is called discipline and punishment that has not evolved or can also be referred to as traditional discipline and punishment. These traditional laws violated the principles of humanity. According to Foucault, this method is wrong, because it is inhumane and unjust and Foucault believes that every human being has the opportunity to change (Foucault, 1975). However, over time discipline and punishment began to evolve. This traditional way of discipline and punishment also occurs in the book *Animal Farm* (Orwell, 1945) :

“Napoleon stood sternly surveying his audience; then he uttered a high pitched whimper. Immediately the dogs bounded forward, seized four of the pigs by the ear and dragged them with pain and terror, to Napoleon's feet. The pig's ears were bleeding, the dogs tasted blood,..” (Orwell, 1945)

In the book it is told that those who break the rules will be punished in the form of torture, one form of torture punishment is using a pack of vicious dogs. In this book it is told that these dogs do not hesitate to bite brutally if one of the animals makes a mistake. The proof can be seen when Napoleon ordered the dogs to torture the young porker councilors to admit mistakes. The dogs did not hesitate to brutally attack and bite the ears of the young council of pigs. This action taken by the dogs was a form of punishment. Traditional punishment is cruel and inflicts cruel bodily harm (Foucault, 1977). We are the "subjects," the victims and perpetrators, of a disciplinary society—a society in which discipline operates as a widespread, familiar, and fundamental form of coercion. The author believes that there is something important and correct about Foucault's account, and so one of the aims of this paper is to lay out its essentials so we can identify, and perhaps resist, the disciplinary dimensions of contemporary life (Hass, 1996).

For Foucault punishment must be of a nature mirroring the crime itself (Saphiro, 2002). In the book *Animal Farm* even to commit a criminal act that mirrors one's own behavior does not exist. There is only merciless punishment without any form of criminal behavior committed by the board, its meaning doing punishment the traditional way in *Animal Farm* which violates Foucault's form of punishment theory. Furthermore, according to Foucault, the theory of punishment is the form of the punishment model. Foucault actually uses the panopticon model,

namely prison. However, in the *Animal Farm*, the rulers do not apply any form of punishment such as prison. There is only a traditional form of punishment which can cause moral and mental development (Driver, 1985).

“Napoleon now called upon them to confess their crimes. They were same four pigs as had protested when Napoleon abolished the Sunday Meetings”. (Orwell,1945)

“The three hens who had been the ringleaders in the attempt. the rebellion over the eggs now came forward and stated that Snowball had appeared to them in a dream and incited them to disobey Napoleon's orders. They, too, were slaughtered. Then a goose came forward and confessed to having secreted six ears of corn during the last year's harvest and eaten them in the night. Then a sheep confessed to having urinated in the drinking pool-urged to do this, so she said, by Snowball -and two other sheep confessed to having murdered an old ram, an especially devoted follower of Napoleon, by chasing him round and round a bonfire when he was suffering from a cough. They were all slain on the spot. And so the tale of confessions and executions went on, until there was a pile of corpses lying before Napoleon's feet and the air was heavy with the smell of blood, which had been unknown there since the expulsion of Jones.” (Orwell,1945)

In the first chapter of *Animal Farm*, it is shown that surveillance power functions as a form of discipline theory. In the initial chapter of the book *Animal Farm* (Orwell, 1945) it is told that before there was an animal revolution. The animals were supervised by the owner of the farm, Jones. Jones always watched the animals from the manor farm every day and fed them, Jones had control over the farm. At the beginning of the chapter, the theory of discipline was actually well implemented, but that all changed due to the rebellion. When the rebellion happens, the system had to be reorganized as a result it had to re-adapt to the new rules (Hasan, et.al., 2020). However, the narrative unfolds as the pigs, initially proponents of equality, gradually seize power and begin to mimic the oppressive human regime they overthrew (Andersson, 2024).

Surveillance plays a crucial role in this story, symbolized by the pigs' use of dogs to ensure obedience from the other animals and suppress any rebellion. The pigs employ propaganda and manipulation, notably through the character Squealer, to be able to control information and maintain their authority. For the theory of discipline, according to Foucault, the body plays an important role as a form of discipline. Because the body is a very manageable object. Therefore,

in the book *Animal Farm* (Orwell, 1945) some forms of discipline are described in the form of the seven commandments, the seven commandments contains like this :

“Whatever two legs are our enemy, four legs have wings is our friend, animals do not wear what human clothes, animals do not sleep in the bed, animals do not drink alcohol, animals are Equal and the end is Animal not kill any other animal”.
(Orwell, 1945)

However, the mistake in forming this precept is that there is no strict form of discipline against the body so that when this rule begins to be violated, the pigs just seem to be careless when violating because they try to conceal their mistakes with the other rules.

“You have heard, then, comrades,” he said, “ that we pigs now sleep in the beds of the farmhouse. And why not? You did not suppose, surely, that there was ever a ruling against beds? A bed merely means a place to sleep in. A pile of straw in a stall is a bed, properly regarded. The rule was against sheets, which are a human invention. We have removed the sheets . from the farmhouse beds, and sleep between blankets. And very comfortable beds they are too! But not more comfortable than we need, I can tell you, comrades, with all the brainwork we have to do nowadays. You would not rob us of our repose, would you, comrades? You would not have us too tired to carry out our duties? Surely none of you wishes to see Jones back?” (Orwell, 1945)

Here the rules of discipline do not follow the body. And the turn for punishment is to actually use the body without the consequences described in discipline; these consequences are described in the form of punishment. The punished animals are forced and commanded to follow Napoleon's orders and show guilt (Putra, et.al, 2024). Of course, this contradicts Foucault's theory that Foucault wanted criminals to reflect on their mistakes. But in the novel *Animal Farm* the pig councillors are forced to admit that they have done nothing wrong, they are just demanding the rights of the people and they are accused of being snowballs.

“They were the same four pigs as had protested when Napoleon abolished the Sunday Meetings. Without any further prompting they confessed that they had been secretly in touch with Snowball ever since his expulsion, that they had in collaborated with him in destroying the windmill, and that they had entered into an agreement with him to hand over *Animal Farm* to Mr. Frederick. They added that Snowball had privately admitted to them that.” (Orwell, 1945)

In addition, there are external factors that make the theory of discipline and punishment fail in the novel *Animal Farm* (Orwell, 1945), one of which is the overlap of justice rights between pigs

and other animals. The main factor in the failure of the imperfect application of disciplinary punishment is due to the selfishness of the leader in achieving goals, as in the book Napoleon is harsh, selfish, and always uses cunning ways for his own purposes. In the book Napoleon deliberately slandered his own friend, Snowball, because Napoleon already felt the threat that his position would be enlarged when Snowball made a windmill.

“One day however, he arrived unexpectedly to examine the plans. He walked heavily round the shed, looked closely at every detail of the plans and snuffed at them once or twice, then stood for a little while contemplating them out of the corner of his eye; then suddenly he lifted his leg, urinated over the plans, and walked out without uttering a word.” (Orwell, 1945)

The other factor of failure is the misunderstanding of loyalty. Someone who is loyal must have a reason. But loyalty in *Animal Farm* has no reason, the loyalty looks odd and it can be wrong, because here the animals' lack knowledge make an understanding of their loyalty.

“After his hoof had healed up, Boxer worked harder than ever. Indeed, all the animals worked like slaves that year. Apart from the regular work of the farm, and the rebuilding of the windmill, there was the schoolhouse for the young pigs, which was started in March. Sometimes the long hours on insufficient food were hard to bear, but Boxer never faltered. In nothing that he said or did was there any sign that his strength was not what it had been. It was only his appearance that was a little altered; his hide was less shiny than it had used to be, and his great haunches seemed to have shrunk.” (Orwell, 1945)

Then, in the book *Animal Farm* (Orwell, 1945) there is one of the horse characters named Boxer who is very loyal to Napoleon. It always follows Napoleon's commandments and accepts everything without revising them. Then without understanding the purpose of the order made by Napoleon, Boxer and his friends are trapped in their loyalty. In fact this is also due to the lack of scientific factors and that is why they can only follow Napoleon's orders without seeing whether the commandments are wrong or right. There are many mistakes between discipline and punishment that contradict Foucault's theory. From making rules about discipline and punishment that are not clear which only makes a series of rules without punishment. Foucault's theory of discipline and punishment does not go well with the meaning of the word *Animal Farm* has failed because of the fatality in carrying out the theory of balance between discipline and punishment.

CONCLUSION

Foucault's theory of discipline and punishment is currently the best theory in making a form of rule in government and power. This theory contains how punishment and discipline go together without using brutal and cruel methods and thinking about one's rights. In the novel *Animal Farm*, the use of the theory of discipline and punishment does not match the expectations of Foucault's theory. In fact, there is a lot of abuse of this theory due to several factors such as greed and selfishness, there is a lack of education for the animals which results in the animals being unable to do anything. Finally, due to the wrong system that is not implemented accordingly, many unexpected events occur. Starting with the animals committing a rebellion that was originally intended for peace and freedom together, but after the rebellion, the opposite occurred, colonization between fellow animals.

REFERENCES

- Andersson, M. (2023). *Unveiling the Panoptic Dystopia*. <https://www.diva-portal.org>
- Christensen, G. (2023). Three concepts of power: Foucault, Bourdieu, and Habermas. *Power and Education*, 16(2), 182–195. <https://doi.org/10.1177/17577438231187129>
- Cole, Y. (2020). Orwell's *Animal Farm* Sticks a Bit Too Close to the Source Material. *Wired*. <https://www.wired.com/story/orwells-animal-farm-review/>
- Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison* by Michel Foucault. (n.d.). Garage. <https://garagemca.org/en/programs/publishing/michel-foucault-discipline-and-punish-the-birth-of-the-prison>
- Driver, F. (1985). Power, Space, and the Body: A Critical Assessment of Foucault's Discipline and Punish. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 3(4), 425-446. <https://doi.org/10.1068/d030425>
- Elaref, A. I. A. (2022). Power's manipulation of the minds and language's creation of knowledge: Foucault's Power/Knowledge as depicted in George Orwell's *Animal Farm*, *Journal of Qena Faculty of Arts* <https://doi.org/10.21608/qarts.2022.110782.1320>
- Faizal, A. (2024). An Analysis Of Power Struggle In George Orwell's Novel 'Animal Farm'. *Jurnal Multidisiplin Ilmu*. <https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/592316-an-analysis-of-power-struggle-in-george-f237aed6.pdf>
- Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Vintage Books.
- Hasan, M. Muhammad, L. Bahasin, G. (2020) Abuse Practice of Power in Orwell's *Animal Farm* : A Historical Approach. *Journal of Culture, Arts, Literature, and Linguistics (CALLS)*, 6(1) <http://dx.doi.org/10.30872/calls.v6i1.3504>

- Hass, L. (1996). Discipline and the Constituted Subject: Foucault's Social History. *Symplokē*, 4(1/2), 61–72. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40550385>
- Joniak-Lüthi, A. (2016). Disciplines, silences and fieldwork methodology under surveillance. *Zeitschrift Für Ethnologie*, 141(2), 197–214. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26384582>
- Lyandi Putra, Y., & Rahman, I. A. (2024). Dark Triad Personality Identification on Napoleon: An Analysis of “Animal Farm”, Novel by George Orwell. *E-LinguaTera*, 4(1), 332–341. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.ubd.ac.id/index.php/pr/article/view/3153>
- Orwell, George. (2024). *Animal Farm : A Fairy Story*. Norris Book
- Reardon, P. T. (2023, July 4). Book review: “Animal Farm” by George Orwell - Patrick T. Reardon. Patrick T. Reardon. <https://patricktreardon.com/book-review-animal-farm-by-george-orwell/>
- Shapiro, S. (2002, June). Michel Foucault's Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison. https://warwick.ac.uk/secondfoufault_reader
- Turkel, G. (1990). Michel Foucault: Law, Power, and Knowledge. *Journal of Law and Society*, 17(2), 170–193. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1410084>
- Woodcock, & George. (2025, February 7). George Orwell | Biography, books, real name, political views, & Facts. Encyclopedia Britannica. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/George-Orwell>